

HORATION PROBLEMS

HEATHER WHITE

Sat. 1.5. 14 f.

*concha salis **pura** et toga quae defendere frigus,
quamvis crassa, queat*

In his discussion of these lines, Shackleton Bailey¹ noted that the mes reading, in line 14, is *puri*. He then compared this passage with Ovid, *Fasti* I,338 *puri lucida mica sails*.

Horace may wish to stress that the salt is pure: cf. Virgil, *Georgics* 4,163 *purissima mela*. It is also possible that Horace has employed adjectival *enallage*. Thus the words *concha salts puri*² mean "a clean shell of salt". For other cases of adjectival *enallage* cf. *G.I.F.* LV, 2003, page 261.

Sat. I. 3. 22-27

*quidam ait, "ignoras te an ut ignotum dare nobis
verba putas?" "egomet mi ignosco" Maenius inquit.
stultus et improbus hic **mos** est dignusque notari.
cum tua **tu videos** oculis mala lippus inunctis,
cur in amicorum vitiis tarn cernis acutum
quam aut aquila aut serpens Epidaurius?*

mos Methner: *amor codd.*

Shackleton Bailey noted (*op. cit.*, page 279) that "if *amor* is right, it must be the self-love which makes people oblivious of their own failings." Better sense can be made of the transmitted text if we place a full stop after *hic* and translate as follows:

1. Cf. D.R. Shackleton Bailey, *Selected Classical Papers*, Ann Arbor, The University Of Michigan Press, 1997, page 278 f. I have used Professor Shackleton Bailey's interesting and informative article as the starting-point of my research.

2. Cf. Tibullus I,1,38–*puris ... fictilibus* ("clean earthenware").

"I pardon myself" said Maenius. This man is stupid and shameless. And his love deserves to be censured."

Note that *que* has been misplaced: cf. Propertius 4,5,21 *Si te Eoa iuvat Nabatharumque aurea ripa*. Of. also Lewis and Short, *A Latin Dictionary*, s.v. *que* VII.

Sat. 1.3. 55 f.

*at nos virtutes ipsas invertimus atque
sincerum furimus vas incrustare*

furimus g; *fugimus* B : *cupimus* cett.

Shackleton Bailey (*op. cit.*, page 279) discussed the three variant readings which occur in line 56, and proposed that we should perhaps print the alteration *incipimus*. I would like to suggest that we should print the reading *cupimus* and understand that the adjective *sincerum* is proleptic. Horace states that "we want (*cupimus*) to plaster over (*incrustare*) a clean (*sincerum*) vessel (*vas*)." Cf. Horace, *Epistles* 1,2, 54 *sincerum est nisi vas quodcumque infundis acescit* ("unless the vessel is clean whatever you pour in turns sour").

Horace means, in other words, that we want to make a dirty vessel appear to be clean by plastering over it.

Sat. I. 3. 80-85

*si quis eum servum...
in cruce suffigat, Labieno insanior inter
sanos dicatur.*

Labieno Bentley: *labeone* (-nem B) *codd.*

The critics have been puzzled by the text of line 82: cf. Shackleton Bailey, *op. cit.*, page 279 f. I would like to suggest that we should print the reading *labeonem* and translate as follows:

"If one were to crucify a blubber-lipped (*labeonem*) slave, who when bidden to take away a dish, has greedily licked up the half-eaten fish and its sauce, now cold, he would be said to be rather insane (*insanior*) amongst sane men (*inter sanos*)."

Cf. Lewis and Short, *op. cit.*, s.v. *labeo* (1): "One who has large lips, who is blubber-lipped".

Sat. I. 3. 117-122

adsit

*regula, peccatis quae poenas irroget aequas,
ne scutica dignum horribili sectere flagello*

(*nam ut ferula caedas meritum maiora subire
verbera non moror*), <*hoc*> *cum dicas, esse pares res
furta latrociniiis*

121 *moror hoc: vereor* codd.

Shackleton Bailey (*op. cit.*, page 280) commented as follows: "120-121 parenthesin feci, *moror hoc (remoror iam Apitz) pro vereor scripsi*". I would like to suggest that textual alteration is not necessary. We should translate as follows:

"For I am not afraid (*non vereor*) that you might strike with the rod somebody who deserves to submit to rather greater (*maiora*) blows (*verbera*), since you say that deceit (*furta*)³ is on a par with highway robbery." Cf. H. Rushton Fairclough, *Horace, Satires, Epistles And Ars Poetica* (ed. Loeb, London 1970, reprint), page 43.

Sat. 2.3. 147

medicus multum celer atque fidelis

In this passage Horace describes the actions of a doctor. He calls the doctor *celer* and *fidelis*, i.e. "efficacious and faithful". Note the employment of adjectival *enallage*. The doctor uses remedies which are "efficacious". Cf. Lewis And Short, *A Latin Dictionary*, s.v. *celer* I,1: *remedia*, quickly working, efficacious, Nep. Att. 21,2. For a similar case of adjectival *enallage* cf. my *Studies in the Text of Propertius*, page 164.

Sat. 2.6. 109

praelibans omne quod affert

praelibans: praelambens v.l.

Shackleton Bailey (*op. cit.*, page 281) commented as follows on the reading *praelibans*: "Waiting on the country mouse, the town mouse, like a good servant, tastes everything beforehand." I would like to suggest that better sense is provided by the variant reading *praelambens*. The town mouse is said to wash beforehand, like a conscientious waiter, everything that he brings to his guest. Cf. Lewis And Short, *A Latin Dictionary*, s.v. *praelambo* II: "Transf., to wash or touch lightly, to bathe gently". Cf. also Lewis And Short, *op. cit.*, s.v. *lambo* II: "Transf., of a river, to flow by, to wash, bathe: *vel quae loca fabulosus Lambit Hydaspes*, washes, Hor. C. I,22,7".

3. Cf. Lewis and Short, *A Latin Dictionary*, s.v. *furtum* II, B: "A secret action, craft, deceit, trick."

Sat. 2.7. 63-65

*ilia tamen se
non habitu mutatave loco peccatque pudice
[cum te formidet mulier neque credat amanti].*

Shackleton Bailey (*op. cit.*, page 282) commented as follows: "*pudice* (*pudenter* iam Peerlkamp) scripsi: *superne* codd." I would like to suggest that Horace is alluding to *fellatio*. The married woman does not want to commit adultery by copulating, and limits herself to *fellatio*⁴ rather than full sexual *intercourse*⁵. Horace therefore says that she sins (*peccatque*) above (*superne*). Cf. Horace, *A.P.* 4 *mulier formosa superne*.

Epist. I.1. 4-6

*Veianius armis
Herculis ad postern fixis latet abditus agro,
ne populum extrema rediens exoret harena.*

line 6 *rediens: totiens* codd.

In this passage Horace compares himself to an old gladiator, who has retired and now lives in the country. Shackleton Bailey (*op. cit.*, page 282) argued that we should print the alteration *rediens*. There is, however, no need for us to alter the mss reading, Horace has employed the historical present. He states that Veianius hid in the country (*latet abditus agro*) so that he would not have to plead with the crowd again and again from the arena's edge: cf. Fairclough (Loeb edition), page 251. For other examples of the historical present cf. my *Studies in the Text of Propertius*, page 118.

Epist. 1.2. 51-53

*qui cupit aut metuit, iuvat ilium sic domus et res
ut lippum pictae tabulae, fulmenta podagrum,
auriculas citharae collecta sorde dolentis.*

52 *fulmenta: fomenta* codd.

The critics have been puzzled by the text of line 52: cf. Shackleton Bailey, *op. cit.*, page 282. I would like to suggest that better sense can be made of the transmitted text if we understand that *pictae* means "painted women". We should translate as follows:

4. For *fellatio* cf. Catullus 59,1 *Rufa Rufulum fellat*. *Fellatio* was usually indulged in by prostitutes: cf. G. Giangrande, *Mus. Phil. Lond.*, 4,1981, page 17.

5. Copulating was dangerous in that it might lead to pregnancy.

"A house and possessions please him as much as made-up women (*pictae*)⁶ a blind man (*lippum*), the consolations (*fomenta*) of a will (*tabulae*) a man with gout (*podagrum*), or citherns ears which suffer with collected matter."

Epist. I. 10. 34-38

*cervus equum pugna melior communibus herbis
pellebat, donec minor in certamine longo
imploravit opes hominis frenumque recepit;
sed postquam victor † violens † discessit ab hoste,
non equitem dorso, non frenum depulit ore.*

victor violens: violens victor v.l.

The reader will note that Shackleton Bailey placed the word *violens* between *cruces*. I would like to point out that perfect sense can be restored to this passage if we print the reading *violens victor* and translate as follows punctuating after *violens*⁷.

"But afterwards he (i.e. the man was violent (*violens*). The victor (i.e. the horse) parted from his enemy. He did not dislodge the rider from his back or the bit from his mouth."

Epist. 2.1. 50-52

*Ennius, et sapiens et fortis et alter Homerus,
ut critici dicunt, † leviter † curare videtur
quo promissa cadant et somnia Pythagorea.*

The critics have been puzzled by the meaning of these lines: cf. Shackleton Bailey, *op. cit.*, page 284 f. Textual alteration is, however, not necessary. We should translate as follows:

"Ennius, the wise and valiant, the second Homer, as the critics say, seems to govern (*curare*) easily (*leviter*), whereby (*quo*) his promises and Pythagorean dreams come to pass (*cadant*)."

Ennius said that Homer appeared to him in a dream and informed him that his soul now dwelt in Ennius' body. The theory of the transmigration of souls was taught by Pythagoras. Cf. Lewis And Short, *op. cit.*, s.v. *curo* II,A: "govern, preside over, command". Horace means that Ennius has a leading position in poetry. Cf. also Lewis And Short, s.v. *cado* II,D: "come to pass, occur".

6. Cf. Plaut. *Poen.* 221.

7. Note the ellipsis of the *verbum substantivum*.

Epist. 2.1. 161-163

*serus enim Graecis admovit acumina chartis
et post Punica bella quietus quaerere coepit
quid Sophocles et Thespis et Aeschylus utile ferrent.*

Shackleton Bailey (*op. cit.*, page 285) was puzzled by the fact that "*admovit* has no proper subject. "Textual alteration is, however, not warranted. *Serus* means here "the late-learner" (i.e. the Romans). Horace is describing how Roman literature was developed, following Greek models. We should translate as follows: "The late-learner (*serus*)⁸ turned his wit to Qreek writings".

Epist. 2.2. 187-189

*scit Genius, natale comes qui temperat astrum,
naturae deus humanae † mortalis † in unum
quodque caput, vultu mutabilis, albus et ater.*

The critics have been puzzled by the meaning of these lines: cf. Shackleton Bailey, *op. cit.*, page 286. Better sense can be made of the transmitted text if we place a full stop after *humanae* and translate as follows:

"I am mortal (*mortalis*)⁹ and changing in countenance for each single person, favourable (*albus*) and malevolent (*ater*)."

Horace adds that he will spend what he likes of his own money and he will not care what his heir thinks of him.

Ars 32-35

*Aemilium circa Ludum faber unus et unguis
exprimet et mollis imitabitur aere capillos,
infelix operis summa, quia ponere totum
nesdet.*

32 *unus*: *imus* v.l.

Shackleton Bailey (*op. cit.*, page 286) noted that Horace refers here to an artist who was "unrivalled at sculpting hair and nails ... but a good ensemble was beyond him." I would like to suggest that Horace is referring to the fact that sculptors, in modelling, give the finishing touch with the nail. Cf. Lewis and Short, *op. cit.*, s.v. *unguis* B,5. We should translate as follows:

8. Gf. Lewis and Short, *A Latin Dictionary*, s.v. *serus* I and Sat. I, 10,21 - *o seri studiorum*. It will be noted that *serus* is a poetic singular: cf. my *Studies in the Text of Propertius*, page 141.

9. Note the ellipse of the *verbum substantivum*.

"There is a very humble sculptor (*faber imus*)¹⁰ near the Aemilian School.
And his nail (*unguis*) moulds and will imitate soft hair in bronze."

Ars 319-322

*interdum speciosa locis morataque recte
fabula nullius veneris sed pondere inerti
valdius oblectat populum meliusque moratur
quam versus inopes rerum nugaeque canorae.*

320 *sed pondere inerti: sine pondere et arte codd.*

Shackleton Bailey noted (*op. cit.*, page 286) that this passage has troubled the critics. I would like to suggest that Horace means that a play (*fabula*) which is beautiful due to its subject matter (*locis*), even though it lacks weight and art, may please an audience more than verses which lack a subject (*versus inopes rerum*) and sonorous trifles (*nugaeque canorae*). Cf. Lewis And Short, *op. cit.*, s.v. locus II,A: "A topic of discussion or thought, a matter, subject". Cf. line 311 where Horace states that words will follow once you have mastered the subject – *verbaque provisam rem non invita sequentur*.

Carm. I. 5. 13-16

*me tabula sacer
votiva paries indicat uvida
suspendisse potenti
vestimenta maris deo.*

Horace states that he has hung up his garments to the god who is master of the sea. I would like to suggest that the poet is alluding to the metaphorical sea of love. Since he has managed to escape from shipwreck on the sea of love, Horace dedicates his clothes to *Amor*: cf. my *Studies in the Text of Propertius*, page 17 f.

Carm. I. 15. 33-36

*iracunda diem proferet Ilio
matronisque Phrygum classis Achillei;
post certas hiemes uret Achaicus
ignis † Iliacas † domos.*

In his discussion of these lines Shackleton Bailey noted that Renehan

10. Cf. my article entitled "Textual Problems In Horace And Virgil" (*Veleia*, forthcoming).

"reviving an idea of Postgate's, thinks the unhoration trochaic base in 56 is a learned allusion to Homeric practice, in which "ἴλιος" is usually treated as though it began with a consonant (because of an original digamma)". I would like to point out that metrical abnormality can be avoided in line 36 if we understand that *ignis* is a plural¹¹. In this poem Nereus addresses Paris and states that he is bringing destruction on Troy. We should translate as follows:

"The Sreeks (*Achaicus*) will burn (*uret*) your loved ones (*ignis*), your Trojan family (*Iliacos domos*)". Cf. Lewis And Short, *A Latin Dictionary*, s.v. *ignis* II,2: "Transf., like *amores*, a beloved object, a flame ... Hor. *Epod.* 14,13." Cf. also Lewis And Short, s.v. *domus* II,B: "A household, family, race."

Carm. 2.10. 5-12

*auream quisquis mediocritatem
diligit, tutus caret obsoleti
sordibus tecti, caret invidenda
sobrius aula.
saepius ventis agitur ingens
pinus et celsae graviore casu
decidunt turres feriuntque summos
fulgura montis.*

Shackleton Bailey noted (*op. cit.*, page 290) that the critics have been puzzled by the text of line 9. I would like to suggest that sense can be made of the transmitted text if we place a full stop after *saepius*. Horace states that whoever loves the golden mean will "rather often" (*saepius*) avoid a hall which excites envy (*invidenda ... aula*),

Carm. 2.20. 17-20

*me Colchus et qui dissimulat metum
Marsae cohortis Dacus et ultimi
noscent Geloni, me † peritus †
discet Hiber Rhodanique poter.*

Scholars have been puzzled by the meaning of these lines: cf. Shackleton Bailey, *op. cit.*, page 290. I would like to suggest that we should place a full stop after *peritus* and translate as follows:

11. Cf. Lewis And Short, *op. cit.*, s.v. *ignis*, where it is not understood that *ignis* is a plural.

"The Colchian shall know me , and the Dacian,who pretends to feel no fear of our Marsian cohorts, and the man who is familiar with (*peritus*) the distant Gelonians (*ultimi ... Geloni*). The Spaniard shall learn about me and the drinkers of the Rhone."

Cf. Lewis And Short, *op. cit.*, s.v. *Geloni*: "In sing.: *Gelonus ...* the Gelonian, collect., Verg. *G.* 3,461". Cf. also Lewis And Short, s.v. *peritus* I (β): "With gen. ... *juris*, Juv. I,128". Cf., moreover, Lucan 9,346 *nautasque loci peritos* ("and sailors familiar with the place").

Carm. 3.1. 33-38

*contracta pisces aequora sentiunt
iactis in altum molibus; hue frequens
caementa demittit redemptor.
tum famuli dominusque terrae
fastidiosus, sed Timor et Minae
scandunt eodem quo dominus*

36 *tum famuli: cum famulis* codd.

Shackleton Bailey (*op. cit.*, page 290) suggests textual alteration in line 36. Perfect sense can, however, be made of the transmitted text if we translate lines 34-37 as follows:

"Here the constant (*frequens*) contractor (*redemptor*) lets down rubble, together with slaves and the master who disdains the land."

Horace refers here to the practice of building villas projecting into the sea. The contractor is described as "constant" (*frequens*) because he is always undertaking new projects.

Carm. 3.6. 21-24

*motus doceri gaudet Ionicos
innupta virgo et fingitur artibus
iam nunc et incestos amores
de tenero meditatur ungui.*

22 *innupta: matura* codd.

Shackleton Bailey proposed (*op. cit.*, page 291) the alteration *innupta* instead of the mss reading *matura*. There is, though, no need for us to alter the transmitted text. Horace is referring to a girl who is sexually mature (*matura*), and who performs provocative dances: cf. my "Textual Problems In Horace" (*Orpheus* 26,2005).

Carm. 3.21. 5 f.

*quocumque lectum nomine Massicum
servas*

Shakleton Bailey noted (*op. cit.*, page 291) that scholars have been puzzled by the meaning of *nomine*. Textual alteration is not necessary. Horace addresses a wine-jar and says that it protects "choice Massic wine (*lectum ... Massicum*) due to its reputation (*nomine*)." Cf. G. Giangrande, *G.I.F.* LVI, 2004, page 316 and my paper entitled "Textual Problems In Horace" (*Orpheus* 26,2005).

Carm. 5.24. 17-20

*illic matre carentibus
privignis mulier temperat innocens,
nec dotata regit virum
coniunx nec nitido laedit adultero.*

20 *laedit: fidit* codd.

Scholars have been puzzled by the meaning of *fidit*: cf. Shackleton Bailey, *op. cit.*, page 291. Textual alteration is, however, not necessary. Horace is referring to a woman who confides in a handsome lover (*nitido ... adultero*).

Cf. Lewis and Short, *op. cit.*, s.v. *fido* ...: "to trust, confide, put confidence in, to rely upon a person or thing."